Modification of the Bel-Robinson type energy-momentum

Lau Loi So

Abstract

Within a quasilocal 2-surface, describing the non-negative gravitational energy-momentum in terms of the pure Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum, the Bel-Robinson tensor B and tensor V are desirable. The Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum implies causality but the converse is not true. Both $\{B,V\}$ satisfy causality. We find that causality can be obtained either $\{B,V\}$ plus tensor S in small sphere or evaluate $\{B,V\}$ from small box region.

arXiv:1302.2412v1 [gr-qc] 11 Feb 2013

1 Introduction

According to the Living Review article, Szabados (see 4.2.2 in [1]) argued that the natural choice and the only choice for describing the non-negative gravitational energy-momentum is the tensor that possesses the Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum property. We simplify his explanation as follows. Let the energy-momentum combination be

$$(E_{ab}^2+H_{ab}^2)+k_1(E_{ab}^2-H_{ab}^2)+k_2E_{ab}H^{ab}-|2\epsilon_{cab}E^a{}_dH^{bd}|\geq 0, \tag{1}$$

where k_1, k_2 are constants. In order to ensure the Lorentz covariant, the only possibility is $k_1=k_2=0$ since the values of E_{ab} and H_{ab} are arbitrary at a given point. It is known that both the Bel-Robinson tensor B and tensor V [2] have the same Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum. In vacuum, $\{B,V\}$ are defined as

$$B_{\alpha\beta\xi\kappa} := R_{\alpha\lambda\xi\sigma}R_\beta{}^\lambda{}_\kappa{}^\sigma+R_{\alpha\lambda\kappa\sigma}R_\beta{}^\lambda{}_\xi{}^\sigma-\frac{1}{8}g_{\alpha\beta}g_{\xi\kappa}\mathbf{R}^2, \tag{2}$$

$$V_{\alpha\beta\xi\kappa} := R_{\alpha\xi\lambda\sigma}R_{\beta\kappa}{}^{\lambda\sigma}+R_{\alpha\kappa\lambda\sigma}R_{\beta\xi}{}^{\lambda\sigma}+R_{\alpha\lambda\beta\sigma}R_\xi{}^\lambda{}_\kappa{}^\sigma+R_{\alpha\lambda\beta\sigma}R_\kappa{}^\lambda{}_\xi{}^\sigma-\frac{1}{8}g_{\alpha\beta}g_{\xi\kappa}\mathbf{R}^2, \tag{3}$$

where $\mathbf{R}^2=R_{\lambda\sigma\rho\tau}R^{\lambda\sigma\rho\tau}$ and the associated energy-momentum are

$$P_\mu=(-E,P_c)=B_{\mu 0ij}\delta^{ij}\equiv V_{\mu 0ij}\delta^{ij}=(E_{ab}^2+H_{ab}^2,2\epsilon_{cab}E^a{}_dH^{bd}). \tag{4}$$

Here the Greek letters mean spacetime, Latin for space and the signature is +2. Note that the electric part E_{ab} and magnetic part H_{ab}, defined in terms of the Weyl curvature [3]: $E_{ab}:=C_{0a0b}$ and $H_{ab}:=*C_{0a0b}$, where $*C_{\alpha\beta\mu\nu}$ indicates its dual for the evaluation.

We are interested in causality, referring to (1), using the 5 Petrov types Riemann curvature for the verification [4]. We find that the Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum implies causality (i.e., $0\leq E-|P_c|$), but the converse does not necessary true. In other words, the combination of these two constants in (1) is not unique for causality. We classify the situation in three cases and they all satisfy causal: (i) $|k_1|\leq 1$ and $k_2=0$. (ii) $k_1=0$ and $|k_2|\leq 2$. (iii) $|k_1|\leq 1$ and $|k_2|\leq 2(1-|k_1|)$. The present paper is trying to explain that $\{B,V\}$ are not the only candidate to demonstrate the causality requirement in quasilocal 2-surface. There exist some relaxation freedom for the modification. The causality can be obtained either $\{B,V\}$ plus an extra tensor S in small sphere or evaluate $\{B,V\}$ directly from small box region. Here we give an practical example, interval belongs to case (i), the Landau Lifshitz pseudotensor which investigates gravitational energy through the tidal heating phenomenon, i.e., Jupiter and Io [5].

2 Modification of the Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum

We examine the gravitational energy-momentum which satisfy causality in quasilocal 2-surface by two approaches: a linear combination between $\{B, V\}$ with S in small sphere and directly evaluate $\{B, V\}$ in small box region.

Consider a simple physical situation within a small sphere region: $t_{\alpha\beta\xi\kappa} + sS_{\alpha\beta\xi\kappa}$, where $S_{\alpha\beta\xi\kappa} = R_{\alpha\xi\lambda\sigma}R_{\beta\kappa}{}^{\lambda\sigma} + R_{\alpha\kappa\lambda\sigma}R_{\beta\xi}{}^{\lambda\sigma} + \frac{1}{4}g_{\alpha\beta}g_{\xi\kappa}R^2$, $t \in \{B, V\}$ and s is a constant. For constant time $t_0 = 0$, the 4-momentum [2] with radius r

$$P_\mu = \int_{t_0} (t^0{}_{\mu\xi\kappa} + sS^0{}_{\mu\xi\kappa}) x^\xi x^\kappa dV = \frac{4\pi r^5}{15}(t^0{}_{\mu ij} + sS^0{}_{\mu ij})\delta^{ij}. \tag{5}$$

Based on [1], the only possibility is $s = 0$ for Lorentz covariant. However, we are searching the value of s that fulfills causal. As the 4-momentum of $S^0{}_{\mu ij}\delta^{ij} = 10(E^2_{ab} - H^2_{ab}, 0)$ and the situation is classified as case (i) in section 1. Hence the criteria for causality is when $|s| \leq 1/10$ for $t \in \{B, V\}$. Obviously that causal guarantee positive energy automatically, but interestingly that we find the converse also true. Practically, we use the Landau Lifshitz pseudotensor [6] as an example

$$t_{\alpha\beta} = \frac{1}{36}(14B_{\alpha\beta\xi\kappa} + S_{\alpha\beta\xi\kappa})x^\xi x^\kappa. \tag{6}$$

In the past, our preference is achieving the pure Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum in small sphere, we thought the result in (6) is forbidden since the sign of the energy component of S is uncertain. This denotes that even how small amount of energy cannot be subtracted from B. However, if we change the focus point on the causality condition, some certain linear combination between B and S are allowable.

Moreover, we demonstrate the 4-momentum in a small box for pure B or V. For simplicity, consider the dimension $(a, b, c) = (\sqrt{1+\Delta}, 1, 1)a_0$ for $|\Delta| << 1$ and a_0 is finite. The corresponding 4-momentum is

$$P_\mu = \int_{t_0} t^0{}_{\mu ij} x^i x^j dV = \frac{\sqrt{1+\Delta}a_0^5}{12}(t^0{}_{\mu ij}\delta^{ij} + \Delta t^0{}_{\mu 11}). \tag{7}$$

Again, we use the 5 Petrov Riemann curvature to compare the energy and momentum. We find that if t is replaced by B which satisfies the causality require small $|\Delta|$, and $\Delta \in (-1, 1]$ if ignore the small 2-surface restriction. Similarly, replace t by V, it is also true for demanding small $|\Delta|$ and $|\Delta| \leq [-\frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{5}]$ without the small region confinement. As there is no restriction that the 2-surface must be a sphere or cube [7], it is legitimate consider other volume element as long as the 4-momentum is causal. Therefore, the result in (7), a linear combination for $t^0{}_{\mu ij}\delta^{ij}$ with an extra tensor $t^0{}_{\mu 11}$, is a physical sensible opportunity for describing the gravitational energy-momentum.

3 Conclusion

In quasilocal 2-surface, the Bel-Robinson tensor B and tensor V are desirable to describe the non-negative gravitational energy-momentum, because both $\{B, V\}$ give the same Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum. In the past, people may consider that only the Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum can manage this specific task. This particular restriction even cannot allow any small amount of energy to be subtracted from $\{B, V\}$. Using the 5 Petrov type Riemann curvature for the verification, we discovered that the Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum implies causality but the converse is not true. We are interested in causality and it is suitable to describe the non-negative gravitational energy-momentum. We find that there exist certain relaxation freedom instead of confining ourselves to achieve the pure Bel-Robinson type 4-momentum. This causality condition can be obtained either add an extra tensor S with $\{B, V\}$ in small sphere or directly evaluate $\{B, V\}$ in small box region.

References

[1] Szabados L B 2009 *Living Rev. Relativity* **12** 4

[2] So L L 2009 *Class. Quantum Grav.* **26** 185004

[3] Carmeli M 1982 *Classical Fields General relativuty and Gauge Theory* (John Wiley & Sons)

[4] Gomez-Lobo A G P 2008 *Class. Quantum. Grav.* **25** 015006

[5] Purdue P 1999 *Phys. Rev. D* **60** 104054

[6] Deser S, Franklin J S and Seminaea D 1999 *Class. Quantum Grav.* **16** 2815

[7] Garecki J 1977 *Acta Phys. Pol.* **B8** 159